

Examining hyperthermia incidents involving children in motor vehicles:

A presentation to NHTSA Nov. 14, 2011

Anara Guard

EDC, Inc.

Sacramento, California

aguard@edc.org

Brief agenda

- Describe my database of hyperthermia fatalities
- Suggest some other sources of data we might be able to tap productively
- Encourage us to go forward with solutions even in the absence of complete data

Hyperthermia database

- Created in Filemaker Pro
- First created in 1999
- Modified and expanded as needed
- Most recent record #770 Oct. 19, 2011
- Contains:
 - 550+ US fatalities non-trunk
 - 40 trunk fatalities
 - 68 international fatalities in 23 countries

Screenshot of a blank record – part one

Browse

Layout: Main Lay

Record: 280

Found: 280

Total: 771

Unsorted

Child name

Vehicle information

Family car Family van School bus Family SUV Daycare van Other vehicle

State

Location

Country

Record number: 771

Gender

International

Data Complete

Region

Tinted windows

yes no unknown

Activity

in child safety seat

yes no

Length left

PLAYING Did not know UNCLEAR

DELIBERATE UNCLEAR

NOT DELIBERATE Left intention

Sleeping--left intentionally

Sleeping--left unintentionally

Forgot

Date

death date

Age

Death yes no

length range

Length group

Other vehicle info:

Temperature

Other person

multiple death incident yes

Age group

Temp group

UniqueNumber

Other activity

Person responsible

Mother Van or bus driver Other

Father Sibling/other child

Daycare provider Self

Investigators

Legal response

Policy response

Health dept response

Death review team response

Other details

Special needs?

Factors

marginal housing

twins

working

MH issues

foster child

mother <21

low SES, unemployed

death certificate yes no

autopsy report yes no

AOD Use yes no unkno

Prior Abuse yes no unkno

Parents Separated yes no unkno

Change in Routine yes no unkno

Multiple Children Present yes no unkno

race and source

Media notes

Final disposition

Flags

Omit

Delayed Death

Not in Analysis

IP Analysis

Overall Analysis

Daycare Related

Flag old

Location of vehicle

Driveway

Street

Parking lot

Other

Source of info

Screenshot of a blank record – part two

Children left in cars

Child name	<input type="text"/>	State	<input type="text"/>	Location	<input type="text"/>	Gender	<input type="text"/>						
Vehicle information	<input type="radio"/> Family car	<input type="radio"/> Family van	<input type="radio"/> School bus	Trunk	<input type="checkbox"/>	Country	<input type="text"/>	International	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="text"/>			
	<input type="radio"/> Family SUV	<input type="radio"/> Daycare van	<input type="radio"/> Other vehicle	Record number	<input type="text" value="771"/>	Data Complete	<input type="checkbox"/>	Region	<input type="text"/>				
Tinted windows		<input type="text"/>	Date	<input type="text"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>								
<input type="radio"/> yes	<input type="radio"/> no	<input type="radio"/> unknown	Length left	<input type="text"/>	death date	<input type="text"/>	Death	<input type="radio"/> yes	<input type="radio"/> no	length range	<input type="text"/>	Length group	<input type="text"/>
Activity		<input type="checkbox"/> PLAYING	<input type="checkbox"/> Did not know	Age	<input type="text"/>								
in child safety seat		<input type="checkbox"/> DELIBERATE	<input type="checkbox"/> UNCLEAR	Other vehicle info:									
<input type="radio"/> yes		<input type="checkbox"/> NOT DELIBERATE	<input type="checkbox"/> Left intention	<input type="text"/>									
<input type="radio"/> no		<input type="checkbox"/> Sleeping--left intentionally											
		<input type="checkbox"/> Sleeping--left unintentionally											
		<input type="checkbox"/> Forgot	Temperature										
			<input type="text"/>										

Screenshot of a blank record – part three

Other activity

multiple death incident

yes

Age group Temp group

UniqueNumber

Person responsible

<input type="checkbox"/> Mother	<input type="checkbox"/> Van or bus driver	<input type="checkbox"/> Other
<input type="checkbox"/> Father	<input type="checkbox"/> Sibling/other child	
<input type="checkbox"/> Daycare provider	<input type="checkbox"/> Self	

Other person

Investigators

--

Legal response

--

Morbidity

--

Policy response

--

Health dept

--

Location of vehicle

<input type="radio"/> Driveway
<input type="radio"/> Street
<input type="radio"/> Parking lot
<input type="radio"/> Other

Screenshot of a blank record – part four

Special needs?

Factors

<input type="checkbox"/>	marginal housing
<input type="checkbox"/>	twins
<input type="checkbox"/>	working
<input type="checkbox"/>	MH issues
<input type="checkbox"/>	foster child
<input type="checkbox"/>	mother <21
<input type="checkbox"/>	low SES, unemployed

death certificate

 yes no

autopsy report

 yes no

AOD Use

 yes no unknown

Prior Abuse

 yes no unknown

Parents Separated

 yes no unknown

Change in Routine

 yes no unknown

Multiple Children Present

 yes no unknown

race and source

Media notes

Screenshot of a portion of a completed record

Children left in cars

Child name **Darnecia Slater** State **TN** Location **Memphis** Gender **female**

Vehicle information: Family car Family van School bus Family SUV Daycare van Other vehicle

Trunk Country International

Record number **1** Date **July 21 1999** Data Complete Region **South**

Length left **5 - 9 hours 7 hours** death date **7/21/1999** Age **22 months** Death yes no

Activity: PLAYING Did not know DELIBERATE UNCLEAR NOT DELIBERATE Left intention

in child safety seat: yes no

Other activity: **UNAWARE benign**

Person responsible: Mother Van or bus driver Other Father Sibling/other child Daycare provider Self

Other person: **adult rider**

Age group **18** Temp group **90**

Investigators: **Dept. of Children's Services will investigate. Tenn Dept of Human Services--Angeline Vaulx**

Legal response: **Driver and van attendant pled guilty to reckless homicide; each received two years and \$500 fine; sentence suspended pending**

Policy response: **State regs require roll call on van for boarding. Owner says will implement worker check of vehicles at unloading**

Health dept response: **hyperthermia due to heat exposure in vehicle passenger accident**

Death review team response: **hyperthermia due to heat exposure in vehicle passenger accident**

Other details: **Children's Palace Learning Center, North Memphis. Licensed for 250 children. One of 4 in chain owned by physician and county commissioner James Ford. Passed state inspection Feb. 1999. In child safety seat directly behind driver according to family. Found by day care workers at 4:15 pm as they prepared to take children home again. Picked up at 7 am with two siblings age 3 and 4; total of 13 children in van on this run. Owner fired van driver and adult rider in response. Driver Laverne Long had worked there for more than a year, attendant Rita Huggis for 8 or 9 months. July 2000 both had hearing arguing for probation**

Special needs? **XXXX**

Factors: marginal housing twins working MH issues foster child mother <21 low SES, unemployed

death certificate yes no

autopsy report yes no

ADD Use yes no unkno

Prior Abuse yes no unkno

Parents Separated yes no unkno

Change in Routine yes no unkno

Multiple Children Present yes no unkno

Location of vehicle: Driveway Street Parking lot Other

Source of info: **Memphis Commercial Appeal www.gomemphis.com/capages/22deadn.htm AP 7/22/99 Commercial Appeal 7/25/00**

race and source: **black ME report**

Media notes: **reporter Michael Erskine 529-2322 or erskine@gomemphis.com**

Final disposition:

Screenshot of a portion of a completed record – part one

Children left in cars

Child name **Darnecia Slater** State **TN** Location **Memphis** Gender **female**

Vehicle information: Family car Family van School bus Family SUV Daycare van Other vehicle

Trunk Country International Record number **1** Data Complete Region **South**

Tinted windows

yes no unknown

Activity: PLAYING Did not know DELIBERATE UNCLEAR NOT DELIBERATE Left intention

Length left: **5 - 9 hours** **7 hours** death date **7/21/1999** Date **July 21 1999** Death yes no

Age **22 months** length range **5-8 hours** Length group **7**

in child safety seat

yes no

Other vehicle info:

Temperature **92 high**

Other activity **UNAWARE benign**

multiple death incident

yes no

Age group **18** Temp group **90**

Person responsible

Mother Van or bus driver Other Father Sibling/other child Daycare provider Self

Other person **adult rider**

UniqueNumber

Screenshot of a portion of a completed record – part two

Investigators

Dept. of Children's Services will investigate. Tenn
Dept of Human Services--Angeline Vaulx

Legal response

Driver and van attendant pled guilty to reckless homicide; each received two years and \$500 fine; sentence suspended pending

Policy response

State regs require roll call on van for boarding. Owner says will implement
worker check of vehicles at unloading

Health dept
response

Death review
team response

Other details

Children's Palace Learning Center, North Memphis. Licensed for 250 children. One of 4 in chain owned by physician and county commissioner James Ford. Passed state inspection Feb. 1999. In child safety seat directly behind driver according to family. Found by day care workers at 4:15 pm as they prepared to take children home again. Picked up at 7 am with two siblings age 3 and 4; total of 13 children in van on this run. Owner fired van driver and adult rider in response. Driver Laverne Long had worked there for more than a year, attendant Rita Huggis for 8 or 9 months. July 2000 both had hearing arguing for probation

Special needs?

Morbidity

hyperthermia due to heat
exposure in vehicle
manner: accident

Location of vehicle

- Driveway
- Street
- Parking lot
- Other

Source of info

Memphis Commercial Appeal
www.gomemphis.com/capage

AP 7/22/99

Commercial Appeal 7/25/00

Screenshot of a portion of a completed record – part three

Other details

Children's Palace Learning Center, North Memphis. Licensed for 250 children. One of 4 in chain owned by physician and county commissioner James Ford. Passed state inspection Feb. 1999. In child safety seat directly behind driver according to family. Found by day care workers at 4:15 pm as they prepared to take children home again. Picked up at 7 am with two siblings age 3 and 4; total of 13 children in van on this run. Owner fired van driver and adult rider in response. Driver Laverne Long had worked there for more than a year, attendant Rita Huggis for 8 or 9 months. July 2000 both had hearing arguing for probation rather than 2 year sentence; Long said center falsified her record to indicate she had HS diploma; Huggis said she had been taking meds for bipolar for 15 years. Long had been written up in previous daycare job for leaving children in a van. Roll call on van not compared with roll call in daycare center and not required by center or state.

In January 1995 2 year old boy was left for 4 hours in parked locked van outside another CP center by bus driver on 2nd day on job. Child unharmed.

police report indicates victim was "lying in blanket" after being brought inside center, placed in crib.

Mother age 33, had 9 children .

Screenshot of a portion of a completed record – part four

Special needs?

Factors

<input type="checkbox"/>	marginal housing
<input type="checkbox"/>	twins
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	working
<input type="checkbox"/>	MH issues
<input type="checkbox"/>	foster child
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	mother <21
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	low SES, unemployed

death certificate

 yes no

autopsy report

 yes no

ADD Use

 yes no unkno

Prior Abuse

 yes no unkno

Parents Separated

 yes no unkno

Change in Routine

 yes no unkno

Multiple Children Present

 yes no unkno

race and source

Media notes

Final disposition

Notes

- Database could be used for retrospective analyses
- Not all fields are complete for every record
- Relies heavily on news accounts, but some records are supplemented by autopsies, police records, court records, etc.
- Paper files supplement the first 400 or so records

Where else might we get data?

- Expand the National Survey of Children's Health <http://childhealthdata.org/learn/NSCH> (already has ?s re: injuries requiring medical care)
- Big box stores and other businesses with large parking lots (for children left unattended)?
- Which insurance policies are activated in a driveway incident? Home-owners? Auto? Health?
- Fire and police department PIOs?

What if we can't get complete data?

- Focus on certain states with high numbers (if not rates) of incidents and provide incentives for participation in data collection?
- No data set has complete data!
- How much do we need to collect in order to know whether the problem is changing?